

AGENDA
Baltimore City Civilian Review Board
REGULAR MEETING
March 22, 2023
Place: Enabled by Zoom
6:00-8:00 pm

I. Welcome & call to order

- Levi Zaslow, Northwestern District
- Tiera Hawkes, Chair, Northeastern District
- Natalie Novak, Secretary, Northern District
- Mel Curry, Southwestern District
- Mariel Shutinya, CRB Supervisor
- Meg Mishou – Special Assistant to the Police Accountability Division
- Sgt. Angel Beaty – PIB
- Amy Cruice, ACLU

II. Review and approval of agenda

- Approved

III. Review and approval of minutes

- January 2023 – Approved
- February 2023 – Approved

IV. Director's Report

- Mariel Shutinya, CRB Supervisor OECR – 7 completed investigation; 4 cases closed with recommendations, 2 had sustained allegations; 10 CRB intakes; 24 notifications from PIB, 1 was converted to CRB
- Amy Cruice, ACLU – would like the number of the total number of open CRB cases so the board is aware of the workload the CRB investigators are handling
- Mariel Shutinya, CRB Supervisor OECR – the CRB has approximately 6 – 7 open investigations and 2 tolled investigations will now be reopened; CRB investigators are not currently overloaded with CRB investigations; ethics financial disclosure forms due 5/1/2023; none of the PAB/CRB bills made it through the cross-over legislative process.

V. New Complaints:

- A. **CRB2023-0016:** Filed 2/8/2023 against an identified BPD officer for harassment, stalking, and threats.
- Voting:
 - Mel Curry, Southwestern – PIB investigation
 - Natalie Novak, Secretary, Northern – pointing a gun is a level of use of force – CRB investigation
 - Levi Zaslow, Northwestern – it is close, but lean towards CRB investigation because there isn't enough information to indicate how far away the officer was from the Complainant and whether the Complainant was threatening towards the

AGENDA
Baltimore City Civilian Review Board
REGULAR MEETING
March 22, 2023
Place: Enabled by Zoom
6:00-8:00 pm

- officer; would like to have the BPD training materials relevant to this in the final report – CRB investigation
- Tiera Hawkes, Chair, Northeastern – CRB investigation

VI. Completed Cases:

- A. **CRB2022-0138:** Filed on August 16, 2022, against identified BPD officers for False Imprisonment. The complaint alleges that that on July 30, 2022 at approximately 12:30am, the Complainant heard gunshots and drove towards the sound to look for her daughter. When she arrived at the scene, the Complainant stated that she and her friend placed their hands on the gunshot victim to help him. Shortly afterwards, the Complainant stated that BPD arrived and began to provide aid to the victim; however, bystanders started to become unsettled because the ambulance was taking a long time to arrive. When the subject officer arrived at the scene, the Complainant stated that the ambulance also arrived and transported the gunshot victim to the hospital where he was later pronounced dead. At the scene, the Complainant's daughter started to walk towards the Complainant's vehicle, and the Complainant heard the subject officer telling the officers to stop her daughter so she can be questioned about the shooting. The Complainant tried blocked her daughter from the officers, but several officers rushed over to her and grabbed her. She demanded the officer to remove their hands off her daughter. During this interaction, neither the Complainant nor her daughter were handcuffed or arrested. The Complainant alleged false imprisonment because she believed the subject officer tried to hold her daughter at the scene against her will when her daughter wasn't a suspect.
- Meeting went into closed meeting status
 - Natalie Novak, Secretary, Northern – it was helpful to see the duration of the incident, it was longer than I thought
 - Tiera Hawkes, Chair, Northeastern – good to see the demeanor of the officers and Complainant and victim; the Complainant (the victim's mother) escalated the situation with her demeanor
 - Mel Curry, Southwestern – the officers were freezing the scene and it wasn't an excessive amount of time
 - Natalie Novak, Secretary, Northern – officers kept the Complainant and victim at the scene even though they wanted to leave; detained them for at least 10 minutes; officers might have detained the Complainant and the victim in violation of BPD Policy 1002; however, officers can freeze the scene for a brief period of time; but wasn't able to find any information about what freezing the scene means or the definition of it; would sustain based on violation of Policy 1002
 - Levi Zaslow, Northwestern – the victim was identified as possibly being in the car when the individual was shot; freezing the scene is a sliding scale based on the seriousness of the scene and the importance of the witness
- B. **CRB2022-0146:** Filed on September 1, 2022 against identified BPD officers for False Imprisonment. The Complainant alleges that on August 14, 2022, he was detained

AGENDA
Baltimore City Civilian Review Board
REGULAR MEETING
March 22, 2023
Place: Enabled by Zoom
6:00-8:00 pm

aggressively and unlawfully for possession of a legal firearm. The Complainant stated that the incident happened inside of Frank's Pizza at 6200 Belair Road. The Complainant stated that he walked into the pizza shop with good friend. While the Complainant and his friend waited for their food, the Complainant stated that seven police officers who were in the pizza shop observed his firearm and asked for his ID. The Complainant said that he complied with the officers and they stated that laws recommend that you don't carry the firearm where people can see it. The Complainant believed that the firearm was concealed on his hip. When the Complainant glanced down at his hip to see if the firearm was showing, he stated that a female officer thought that he was reaching for the gun. The Complainant stated that the officers immediately slapped handcuffs on him before giving him a chance to show his ID and permit to carry. The Complainant alleged false imprisonment because the officers handcuffed him when he wasn't a threat and had a permit to carry. The Complainant stated that after several minutes in handcuffs, the officers verified his permit to carry. The Complainant said that he felt like his rights were violated because he was not reaching for his concealed firearm and the officers did not give him a chance to verify his identity. After his credentials were verified the Complainant stated that he was released without an apology or explanation as to why he was detained. The Complainant stated that he was told that he was detained due to the "gun violence in Baltimore City."

- Closed meeting status
 - Levi Zaslow, Northwestern – can the officers walk up to an individual just because they are wearing a firearm and cuff/detain them just because they are carrying a firearm as a licensed gun owner?
 - Mel Curry, Southwestern – the officers did not need to put him in handcuffs
 - Levi Zaslow, Northwestern – the officers' actions change very quickly from verifying the permit to detaining him because he was reaching for his gun; he was detained once when he was surrounded, even before he was cuffed; officers cuffed him before they knew whether or not he had the card in his wallet; the officers changed their tune from verifying the permit to him reaching for the gun; is it okay for him to have it in his car or must it be in his wallet? His movement didn't seem fruitive
 - Tiera Hawkes, Chair, Northeastern – do the officers have cause to detain him or cuff him to ask about the permit? It seemed like it was a nervous tick that the Complainant reached down; unclear if he reached a second time.
 - Mariel Shutinya, CRB Supervisor OECR – they cuffed him, removed the gun from his possession; and then kept the handcuffs on him
 - Natalie Novak, Secretary, Northern – officer cuffed the Complainant and then called the Maryland State Police to ask whether or not he was doing something illegal, so she had no idea whether he was doing something illegal when the officer cuffed him
 - Hold over until April meeting
- C. **CRB2022-0072/PIB2022-1003**: Complaint for Harassment alleges that on 3/10/21 officers raided his home, during which they did not find anything illegal and confiscated a large sum of money that they did not report. On 10/8/2021, officers again raided his apartment, did not find anything illegal and again confiscated a large amount of money,

AGENDA
Baltimore City Civilian Review Board
REGULAR MEETING
March 22, 2023
Place: Enabled by Zoom
6:00-8:00 pm

which they did not report on the inventory list. The Complainant was also charged with attempted murder, even though the evidence did not support the charges and the victim reported that it was someone else. The Complainant is currently charged with a shooting, but there is no evidence to support the charge.

- Mel Curry, Southwestern – Complainant’s statements were inconsistent, which affected his credibility – Not sustain
- Tiera Hawkes, Chair, Northeastern – the two subject officers were at some of the incidents but not at other cited incidents; unfortunately, there wasn’t any evidence about the stolen money or property; Complainant’s credibility wasn’t strong enough to sustain the allegation
- Levi Zaslow, Northwestern – there wasn’t much of a link between the facts of this case and the GTTF; officer R didn’t really have any interaction with the Complainant; in regard to officer D, the ATF was present and securing the scene the entire time during the search of his home; puts me on 50/50 ground, so the evidence hasn’t met the burden - Not sustain
- Natalie Novak, Secretary, Northern – did not find enough evidence to sustain the complaint – Not sustain
- Will do email vote

VIII. Public Comment

IX. Old Business

- Vote on bylaws – Approved

X. New Business

- Tiera Hawkes, Chair, Northeastern – appointed as Chair
- Natalie Novak, Secretary, Northern – appointed as Secretary
-

XI. Adjournment